



Research Paper

Displacement, Gender Violence and Social Inequities in Two Recent Indian Anthologies

Dr Vinita Gupta Chaturvedi

Associate Professor
Department of English
Delhi College of Arts & Commerce
University of Delhi

Abstract

In her seminal work *The Second Sex*, Simone de Beauvoir observed that a woman is not born, but rather becomes a woman and as a corollary to this, faces eternal discrimination. Over the years, women's writings have engaged with the theme of gender-based inequalities, violence, discrimination, and marginalisation on account of their being the weaker sex. Two recent anthologies, *Monalisa No Longer Smiles* (2022), a melange of short fiction, non-fiction, poems from writers from across the world and *The Second Wife & Other Stories* (2022) by creative writer and noted academician Nandini Sen, explore the complex relationship between gender, sexuality, and violence, to identify problems that are endemic to society and envisages hopeful remedials. My paper would attempt a close reading of the two volumes which contain rich and varied stories which are both temporal and spatial; rooted firmly in historical time and timeless; which deal with problems that disadvantage women in contemporary times and problems that have persisted from the times of the epics. The debut work of the author and the collection of stories are notably significant not only for presenting an array of identifiable and relatable fictional women- characters trapped in their circumscribed existence, cutting across class, caste, and ethnicity; but also, for their sociological preoccupation with female education, human rights violation, and study of everyday micro-aggressions that women have to contend with.

Keyword: violence, marginalisation, women's writings, freedom, inequality

Received 08 Dec., 2023; Revised 19 Dec., 2023; Accepted 21 Dec., 2023 © The author(s) 2023.

Published with open access at www.questjournals.org

The Paper

In the present times when media is awash with disturbing crimes against women, the disadvantages they suffer in domestic and professional spaces, and the social inequities they experience in everyday lives two anthologies of short stories *Monalisa No Longer Smiles* (2022) edited by Mitali Chakravarty and noted academician and creative writer Nandini Sen's *The Second Wife & Other Stories* (2022) take these problems head-on to present a panoramic canvas that explores the complex relationship between gender, sexuality, and violence; class and caste; in order to identify problems that are endemic to society at large and envisages hopeful remedials. The two anthologies are timely and relevant in that they deal with the quotidian, but they also offer insights into human condition itself. They are about empowering the disempowered, about both men and women breaking free, about self-realisation and self-discovery and profiling of successes despite all adversities. Ultimately, they are about the triumph of human spirit, and at a time when the world is staring at darkness, they offer a sliver of hope by reinforcing ideals of sorority and faith in humanity, which Sen reiterates in her interview in the Telegraph: "My characters have small successes... and the agency to step from fear to fearlessness".

The Second Wife & Other Stories (2022) is an anthology of eleven short stories. This is the first fictional offering from academician Nandini Sen. For an author whose academic writings are marked by discipline and theoretical rigour, her creative work is written with remarkable lucidity, economy of words and clarity of expression. But a common denominator which runs through both her fictional and non-fictional works is an abiding preoccupation with the condition of women. The author renders full justice to her new role as a raconteur offering glimpses into the lives of myriad women-wives, daughters, mothers, professionals, mythic women and those living a deprived life on the margins. The stories provide vivid details of the everyday,

quotidian lives of women caught in domestic drudgery, trapped in infelicitous marriage or simply finding their aspirations stymied by a society ruled by patriarchal dictates. But the stories are also about their quiet assertion, new beginnings and about the suppressed finding a vocation, meaning and true calling in life. The epigraph, a quote from the African politician Thomas Sankara, an advocate of women's causes : "I can hear the roar of women's silence" sets the tone of the collection and encapsulates the intent of the volume, which the author acknowledges is to "explore 'herstories' in a patriarchal set up"(183).

The stories straddle different geographies and a spatial time span. They are set in very recognisable, familiar surroundings of India- mofussil towns , thriving metropolises , the Naxal-dominated hinterland, the pre-independence Bengal in the throes of nationalist fervour, with an occasional foray into a London apartment or a Dubai complex. The stories revolve wholly around women and are narrated through their point of view. With the exception of the inaugural, "The Sapphire Ring" and the fantastical "Queen Kaikeyi", recounted by male narrators suffering from feelings of guilt and betrayal; all the other stories whether using first person narration or omniscient, are told entirely through the women's perspective. The world of the stories is peopled with variegated but identifiable characters-from a mother reluctant to accept her son's sexual orientation, to women realising their hitherto dormant potential, to broken women resolving to pick up the fragmented pieces of their lives and moving on. The wide-ranging subject matter deals with problems endemic to society both urban and rural, such as girl's education, sexual exploitation, infidelity, unwanted pregnancies and domestic abuse. The collection is an eclectic mix of stories, few end on a promising note, some offer a feeble ray of light while others are dark and unrelenting, even resulting in self-annihilation . The first two bone-chilling stories contribute to an ominous sense of foreboding which looms large over the rest, and with every turn of the page the reader waits with bated breath for something sinister to happen. Perhaps the intriguing and ambiguous cover of the novel, in dominant and disturbing red, works subliminally to this end as well.

The non-linear narration of the first two stories builds towards the accretion of these breath-holding suspenseful moments. If Nabonita's story were told chronologically, it wouldn't have had the desired impact of poetic justice. The mysterious opening paragraph flash forwards to the climactic end, with a description of Nabonita stealing an unnamed object from the kitchen and concealing it in her raiment: "The mere thought sent a chill up her spine. She could feel its sharp edge against her body as she pictured herself carrying it to her bed" (19). Similarly, in the expository scene of "The Sapphire Ring" , when the girlfriend of the ageing author-narrator persuades him to write about the Naxalbari movement of his college days, his discomfiture and evasiveness suggest that he is trapped in a phantasmagorical past. What unfolds is a tale of love, lust, guilt and betrayal. But there are a few exceptions like "Laila" where Sen mockingly subverts the reader's expectations of a terrible outcome. At the anti-climactic end of the story the author playfully manages to pull the rug from under the reader's feet, as it were, especially when the reader by this time has become so heavily predisposed to expecting the worst.

Many of these women-centric stories, including the eponymous "The Second Wife" are about women at the cusp of asserting their identity and coming into their own despite all odds. Set against the backdrop of the Indian national movement for independence, "The Second Wife" has the canvas of a novella. It succinctly deals with most of the themes interspersed across other stories such as circumscribed domestic lives of women, suspicion surrounding girl's education, asymmetrical marital relations and an incremental desire in women to break free of all shackles. It is a marvel that the writer packs in so many tropes into this story. One is compelled to compare Sen's handling of the short-story format to what critics say about writer Katherine Mansfield's treatment of the genre- that in her hand it becomes perfectly amenable to exploring the feminine consciousness and feminist worldview. This is equally applicable to Sen's handling of the medium. The growth arc that Sen gives to her protagonist Bela is remarkable. From her tomboyish childhood to book-loving adolescence to the moniker she earns in the Dutta household, Bela remains fiercely independent; which is reflected in her exercising control over her reproductive system, her steely resolve to embrace non-materialism and in her determined political action. Her desire for unfettered freedom is coterminous with the nation's and the clarion call for freedom rending the streets of Calcutta resounds in her inner being. Both attain it.

Ultimately all the stories in the anthology are about women breaking free, about self-realisation and self-discovery. For some their action may mark baby steps towards freedom, like The Performer, "whose troubles were far from over, but for a change, she was battle ready" (55). Or when the disadvantaged Jyotsna, suffering from triple marginalisation of class, caste and gender realises that "The only way she would ever be free would be if she fought her own battle. There was no turning back now "(154). Nabonita has had to contend with fractured identity all of her young life- she is lovingly called 'Nabo' in her native tongue which gets anglicised to 'Nita' in her English-medium school and then she shamefully has the objectified epithet 'Bonny' thrust upon her. But she manages to integrate these pieces even as she sets out on an uncharted path unassisted, directionless, "on the cobbled streets of the unfamiliar city" (40). It goes to the credit of the writer that she describes these life-altering moments in clear, lucid prose, eschewing the ornamental flourishes. The lucidity and directness of style stand out during these climactic moments of epiphany : "Laila... felt happy in the presence of two people she loved the most. She knew this was a fleeting moment and tomorrow she might not feel the

same. But tomorrow was another day and she would face it, chin up. Today was what mattered.”(92) In a marvellous turn of phrase, the mother in ‘Lipstick’ “finally dared to come out of the closet” (68), shedding years of outmoded ideas and beliefs. Sample the end of ‘Happy Times’ which brings about a startling but pleasant realisation to the reader and protagonist alike, that the secret to mental peace and equanimity is quite simple : “Aisha felt a strange kind of happiness...She settled on her drawing room sofa, covered herself with a quilt. That night, she took the landline off the hook and also remembered to put her mobile phone on silent mode.”(130) Stories are interspersed with aphorisms “Life is an exam with an unknown syllabus”(77), “We tend to co-habit with our past”(7)

The anthology is rich and varied but I must confess to a personal favourite-the complex and multi-layered “Queen Kaikeyi”. I would love to privilege this absolutely masterful reworking of an epic tale. This short story subsumes within it the wide arc of the familiar story of the much reviled queen of *Ramayana* who set the epic on its tragic trajectory. It offers an interesting spin to Kaikeyi’s reason for sending Rama into exile; according a higher purpose to her action than the sages would allow her. Fully aware that she was destined to set the cosmic chain of events in motion she is willing to take on the world’s opprobrium for all times to come. She confides her real motives to Rishi Matanga but he keeps the secret to himself, fearing the world’s judgement, even though he has unconditionally loved her:

Time and again, I was racked with the guilt of being Kaikeyi’s secret keeper. The realm of human beings being judgemental beyond reason, I would probably do more harm to her than good if I tried to defend her. There would be the usual questions and muckraking. Even a Maharishi like me would not be spared. So I let her go down in history as the woman who wrecked a royal family, conspired to dethrone her stepson and eventually responsible for the king’s death...I let the future generations malign her (166).

His deference to public censure contrasts her courage and there is no absolution for him. His hollow reasoning for not revealing her true motivations to the world are at best specious. In choosing to remain silent he also becomes representative of all men who fail to rise to occasion in defence of women. But the silent love of Matanga and Kaikeyi’s awareness of it, has spawned some tender moments of fellowship in the story. The palpable physical tension he feels for the unattainable Queen, the difference in social hierarchy which would forbid any fructification of such a relationship is reminiscent of Karna’s unspoken love of Draupadi in that other retelling of the epic, Divakaruni’s *The Pallace of Illusions*. Sen’s story contains too many possibilities to be explored further and perhaps here lie the germ and kernel of an unborn novel that we should expect next from the debutant writer. Sen’s first fictional offering has built a strong conversation around the everyday problem of women’s discrimination in private and public life and the author is being extensively feted in the media. The collection marks the arrival of the academic as a creative writer, some of the stories in the collection show a great degree of maturity and she confesses to her interviewer in the telegraph, that, “I’ve always been a closeted writer”. Her thoughts and ideas reach a full fruition in these short stories.

Monalisa No Longer Smiles is an eclectic collection of short stories, poems, essays, conversations with writers and thinkers from across the globe who articulate their thoughts on the problems that plague our societies at large, problems that are built across the fault lines of class, class, ethnicity, gender and religion. The eponymous story stands out, like Sen’s ‘The Santhal Maid’ for its portrayal of the vicissitudes in which the domestic help find herself trapped. The worlds of both the teenage slave workers are ruled by benign patriarchy. The avuncular Mr Roy who boasts of treating the Santhal maid as a daughter but balks at the idea of condoning her marriage, or the ageing grandfather in Sunil Sharma’s ‘Monalisa No Longer Smiles Here’ who treats the young help kindly enough but has no qualms about employing a minor in the house because he realises how indispensable she is to a household of professionals, shows the disinclination of even the kinder men to come to the aid of women. The extremely circumscribed existence of these two girls is contained in the name-defying title of the stories. The identity of the maid in Sen’s story is enmeshed in her tribe and ethnicity, while the girl in Sharma’s story has the name Monalisa thoughtlessly thrust upon her. The absolutely perfunctory nature of calling the maid by this anomalous name occurs in the opening lines: “Everybody called her Monalisa. Nobody knew or cared who the real Monalisa was. The name just stuck on. Just like that” (197).

The sense of displacement which Monalisa feels when she is plucked out from her cramped but familiar slums of Vasant Kunj, New Delhi gets magnified in the distraught poem by a fleeing Ukrainian, Lesya Bakun in ‘Refugee in My Own Country’, whose peregrination across the European continent have put her ill at ease in human society, bereft of a definitive identity:

I am Kharkiv.

I am Volnovakha.

I am Kyiv....

Nine years ago, I was in Strasbourg, France.

Seven years ago, I was in Dublin, Ireland.

Two years ago, I was in Istanbul, Turkey (123).

Chakravarty’s collection is varied and has a more expansive canvas which goes beyond depiction of marginalisation and gender to talk of human rights violation. The epistolary tragic story ‘Zohra, What If You

Were My Daughter' is addressed by the writer, Aysha Baquir to a now dead Zohra, a child domestic worker in Pakistan who was caged, abused and beaten to death by her employer couple, for setting some of their captive parrots free. The letter bemoans the problem of child labour and the inadequacy and inefficacy of Employment of Child Labour Act which has failed to safeguard children from working in hazardous occupations. The story of Zohra exhorts collective action as the only remedial for human rights violation. The sympathetic writer implicates every member of the society who are complicit in this exploitation and asks rhetorically: "If I am part of the problem, can I even be part of any solution?" (186). She then offers a solution and proceeds to make a plea for inclusion, empathy, and humanity:

Not if I continue to exclude the poor and vulnerable populations from the decision-making process and appoint myself as their representative or spokesperson. Not if I continue to excuse the culprits because they are rich, powerful, my friends, friends of friends, or someone I don't want to offend. Not if I leave millions of child labourers to be physically and sexually abused without taking any action. A viable, sustainable and progressive movement rests on the voices of all stakeholders committed to the cause (186).

The two anthologies are very timely in sensitizing the reader to the blighted condition of the present day world. While Nandini Sen's *The Second Wife & Other Stories* imaginatively brings alive a wide array of women characters, mothers, daughters and wives caught in the familiar urban and rural Indian spaces, riven with casteist, misogynist and androcentric forces; *Monalisa No Longer Smiles* transcends borders to talk about the plight of the marginalised and the disenfranchised all across the world. But ultimately these stories offer glimpses of hope; posit faith in human solidarity, fellowship and collective action; and are about resilience, courage and triumph of human spirit.

Works Cited:

- [1]. Sen, Nandini C. *The Second Wife & Other Stories*. New Delhi: Om Books International , 2022.
- [2]. Chakravarty, Madhumita. Ed. *Monalisa No Longer Smiles: An Anthology of Writings from across the world*. New Delhi: Om Books International , 2022.
- [3]. Chatterjee, Amitava. Ed. *Gender and Modernity*. Kolkata: Setu Prakashan, 2015.
- [4]. Nandini Sen's Interview in *The Telegraph* online by HRITAM MUKHERJEE | PUBLISHED 23.05.22, 03:31 PM
- [5]. <https://www.telegraphindia.com/my-kolkata/people/delhi-university-english-professor-and-author-nandini-sen-discusses-her-new-book-the-second-wife-other-stories-and-her-kolkata-connection/cid/1866465>
- [6]. accessed on 25.11.2023