



Research Paper

Efforts of the Ternate City Government in Handling the Food Crisis with a Collaborative Governance Approach.

Mohbir Umasugi

¹(Department of Public Administration,
Faculty of Law, Social Sciences, and Political Science,
Open University Indonesia)

ABSTRACT: The objective of this research is to analyze the efforts of the Ternate City Government in addressing the food crisis through a collaborative governance approach. The Ternate City Government has established cooperation with the East Halmahera Government in the field of agriculture to meet the horticultural food needs in Ternate. Qualitative method with a descriptive analysis approach is used to examine the research focus. Data collection is done through interview techniques, observation, and documentary study. The units of analysis in this research are the Ternate City Government, which consists of the Department of Agriculture, Bapelitbangda, and the Cooperation Section of the Ternate City Government. Data analysis is conducted in three stages: data reduction, data presentation, and conclusion drawing. The research findings indicate that the cooperation with East Halmahera Regency has a promising prospect, as they have support in the agricultural sector. However, the collaborative governance process needs to be strengthened as there are still weaknesses in aspects such as dialogue among parties, joint agility, commitment to collaborative governance, shared understanding among parties, and shared benefits. This collaborative governance also faces challenges in increasing agricultural production, improving production quality, opening market access, managing agricultural waste, managing pests and diseases, and seed management. This research contributes to the study of collaborative governance in the agricultural sector in the eastern part of Indonesia.

KEYWORDS: Collaborative Governance Process, Agriculture, Ternate, and East Halmahera.

Received 14 July, 2023; Revised 25 July, 2023; Accepted 28 July, 2023 © The author(s) 2023.

Published with open access at www.questjournals.org

I. INTRODUCTION

Indonesia, as an agrarian country in the world, does not guarantee that all regions can meet their own food needs. Many areas have to import food from outside because their agricultural production is limited. This condition is exacerbated by the global food crisis post-COVID-19 pandemic and the Ukraine-Russia war situation in Europe. Therefore, the food crisis becomes a threat to Indonesia. This can be seen in the national agricultural inflation data as of July 2022, which reached 11 percent and exceeded the target range of 2-4 percent (Kalesang, 2022). Thus, it is stated by Badrudin, et al., (2022) that this condition falls into a state of food crisis as it relates to food components such as security, resilience, and availability. Therefore, each region needs to develop strategies to build food reserves in response to the global food crisis threat (Lasminingrat & Efriza, 2020).

Ternate City is one of the regions in Indonesia that faces the problem of availability of horticultural food. This includes limited agricultural production, dependence on agricultural products from areas outside Ternate, and resistance to price increases in the local market. As a result, Ternate City is unable to overcome the food crisis and requires cooperation with other regions to meet local food needs. Therefore, the objective of this research is to analyze the collaboration between the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera District Government in the agricultural sector using the Collaborative Governance approach.

In an effort to meet the needs of horticultural food, the Ternate City Government collaborates with the East Halmahera District under the coordination of Bank Indonesia Representative Office in North Maluku. East Halmahera has advantages in the agricultural sector, and its geographical location is not far from Ternate City. It is still within the North Maluku Province, which facilitates the distribution of agricultural products to Ternate City.

The issue of agricultural crisis has been extensively researched, especially regarding the collaborative governance approach in agriculture. Hikmawan, et al. (2020), in their study, showed that there are several challenges in creating food resilience through collaboration models between young farmers, the government, and the private sector. Furthermore, the research findings by Haris (2022) revealed that the collaboration between the Department of Agriculture, stakeholders, and the community has been successful in improving the performance quality of the agricultural sector in East Manggarai. However, the supply of government-subsidized fertilizers and the one-sided favoritism in providing agricultural tools to the community remain major obstacles. On the other hand, the study by Fatimah, et al. (2021) described that collaborative governance has not yet achieved empowerment for Farmer Groups in Wajo District. This is due to inadequate network structure, trust, commitment, governance, and institutional capacity.

Other studies in various countries have also been conducted, such as the research by Liu, et al. (2021) on collaborative practices among local governments in China. The research findings indicate that the non-participation of higher-level governments and strong competition modes hinder cooperation, and that local leadership is crucial in implementing collective governance among local governments. On the other hand, the study by Scott and Merton (2021) highlights the role of goal commitment in successful implementation of collective governance. A stronger inter-institutional collective governance network to achieve outcomes should be established by a public manager. Additionally, reducing transaction costs in the implementation of collective governance is also necessary. Thus, the difference of this research from various previous studies that have been conducted regarding collaborative governance lies in the focus and research location. The focus of this research is to analyze the process of collaborative governance and outline the challenges that will be faced by the parties involved.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 Concept of Collaborative Governance

Collaborative Governance is defined as a process that involves public institutions and non-public stakeholders in contributing to joint decision-making in an official capacity. This process focuses on consensus and deliberation to establish or implement public policies or manage public programs or assets (Ansell & Gash, 2008). Balogh explains that Collaborative Governance is a process and structure used to manage and make public policy decisions involving various parties, including government, private institutions, and civil society, to achieve public goals that cannot be achieved by one party alone (Emerson, et al., 2012). Bianchi, Nasi, & Rivenbark (2021) elaborate that collaborative governance is a multi-actor collaboration typically led by public sector organizations to build consensus among stakeholders on a set of formal policies designed and implemented to generate public value. It is an effort to achieve common goals through cooperation among various involved parties. Additionally, Haris (2022) adds that Collaborative Governance is a process that involves various stakeholders in achieving goals together.

Based on the above understanding, one can draw the conclusion that Collaborative Governance is a process that involves various parties, including government, private institutions, and civil society, to achieve public goals that cannot be achieved by one party alone. This process focuses on reaching a shared agreement in developing a program agenda with the aim of building consensus among stakeholders and implementing it to generate public value.

2.2 Framework and Challenges of Collaborative Governance

Ansell & Gash (2008) explain that the framework of the collaborative governance model consists of four interacting variables: initial conditions, institutional design, leadership, and collaborative processes. Initial conditions govern the baseline levels of trust, conflict, and social capital, institutional design establishes the basic rules, and leadership provides mediation and facilitation. The collaborative process itself is iterative and nonlinear. This model depicts how these variables interact to shape an effective collaborative process.

Meanwhile, Newman et al. (2004) revealed that there are several issues hindering the development of 'collaborative governance'. One of them is the lack of public participation space that has not been placed in the context of government policies, thus requiring initiatives to provide public participation in collaborative governance. On the other hand, Amsler (2016) reminds us that collaborative governance must incorporate a legal framework as an important variable. Institutional analysis provides a theoretical framework that combines rules and laws to understand the integration of legal variables in collaborative governance. Moreover, Bianchi, Nasi, & Rivenbark (2021) highlight several challenges such as adopting appropriate methods to support leaders and other stakeholders in designing and implementing strong strategic plans that lead to sustainable community outcomes. This includes meaningful dialogue and policy alignment among organizations, managing conflicts and building trust, building and disseminating shared strategic resources, modeling cause-and-effect relationships, measuring non-monetary performance, transforming the evaluation of collaborative governance,

strengthening results-based approaches, and experimenting with how performance governance can enhance processes, outcomes, and accountability.

III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

The research methodology used in this study is a qualitative approach. The units of analysis are the actors involved in the implementation of the collaboration to address the food crisis in Ternate City, such as the Department of Agriculture, Department of Trade and Industry, and the Regional Development Planning and Research Agency (Bapelitbangda). The data used in this research consist of primary and secondary data collected from the units of analysis through techniques such as interviews, observations, and literature review on agriculture in Ternate City and East Halmahera Regency. All the collected data are then analyzed through several stages, starting from data screening, data presentation, and drawing conclusions. The data gathered from the field are further collected and selected in the data screening process. The results of the data screening are presented in the form of narrative texts about the actors involved in the agricultural collaboration and the efforts of the Ternate City government in addressing the agricultural crisis. Finally, in the last stage, conclusions are drawn regarding the implementation of the agricultural collaboration between Ternate City and East Halmahera Regency.

IV. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Collaborative Governance of Ternate City Government with East Halmahera Regency

The City Government of Ternate is making efforts to address the potential food crisis by collaborating with the East Halmahera Regency Government. The collaboration is done because East Halmahera has potential and advantages in the agricultural sector. Based on the data of food production in East Halmahera in 2020 and 2021, it continues to increase. The production of horticultural crops reached 10,899 tons in 2020 and increased to 11,799 tons in 2021. The harvested horticultural crops include long beans, cucumbers, mustard greens, watermelons, tomatoes, scallions, eggplants, bell peppers, and chili peppers. The increase in food production is also supported by the expansion of agricultural land, where the agricultural land in 2020 was around 15,297 hectares and increased to 16,083 hectares in 2021 (Central Statistics Agency, 2023).

The East Halmahera Regency Government has a significant advantage in the agricultural sector. The data on food production in East Halmahera in 2020 and 2021 continues to increase. The harvested horticultural crops include long beans, cucumbers, mustard greens, watermelons, tomatoes, scallions, eggplants, bell peppers, and chili peppers. Additionally, the agricultural land area has also experienced a significant increase, where the agricultural land in 2020 was around 15,297 hectares and increased to 16,083 hectares in 2021. This indicates that the East Halmahera Regency Government is making efforts to increase food production and become one of the largest food providers in the region. Therefore, the City of Ternate's efforts to collaborate in the agricultural sector are a rational step in responding to the food crisis.

Meanwhile, the data on the quantity of horticultural commodity production in the Ternate region consists of 3.10 tons of shallots, 18.7 tons of small chili peppers, 26.8 tons of bell peppers, and 68 tons of tomatoes in 2020. In 2021, the production increased to 4.80 tons of shallots, 135.50 tons of chili peppers, 23.70 tons of bell peppers, and 68.10 tons of tomatoes. From this data, there was an increase in the production of chili peppers from 18.7 tons in 2020 to 135.50 tons in 2021.

The limited production of horticultural crops in Ternate requires rice, tomatoes, shallots, garlic, carrots, cabbage, and potatoes to be sourced from outside the Ternate region. Approximately 80 percent of the horticultural needs are supplied from North Sulawesi, South Sulawesi, East Java, and West Nusa Tenggara. The remaining 20 percent is fulfilled by local farmers' production.

Based on the data above, it can be seen that the agricultural sector in East Halmahera Regency is more superior compared to Ternate City. This can be seen from the larger amount of harvested food production in East Halmahera compared to Ternate City. Additionally, the agricultural land area in East Halmahera is also larger than Ternate City, with 15,297 hectares in 2020 and 16,083 hectares in 2021. This indicates that the agricultural sector in East Halmahera is more superior compared to Ternate City.

Bank Indonesia in the North Maluku region has initiated a collaboration between the Ternate City Government and East Halmahera Regency to encourage the participation of all stakeholders in the agricultural sector in both areas. Bank Indonesia provides access to the Ternate City Government to collaborate with its supported farmer groups, where the harvested produce is directed to be sold in Ternate City. Food traders in the markets of Ternate City are also involved in purchasing the agricultural produce.

The Head of Bank Indonesia's North Maluku Representative Office, Eko Adi Irianto, stated that in order to anticipate inflation, collaboration between local government organizations and vertical stakeholders is needed to ensure smooth distribution of supplies. Communication is also important to maintain prices and prevent speculation and hoarding of basic commodities (nuansamalut.com, 2023). Bank Indonesia has warned

of the threat of a food crisis in Ternate City because food production still relies on other regions, so the government's capacity alone is unable to overcome this crisis (kalesang.id, 2022).

4.2 Analysis of Collaborative Governance Process

To examine the collaborative governance between the City Government of Ternate and the East Halmahera Regency Government, the author uses the indicators of collaborative governance processes from Ansell & Gash (2008) as a basis for analyzing the implementation of the cooperation. Considering that this collaboration has not reached one year yet and the purpose of this research is to analyze the implementation of collaborative governance and provide considerations to strengthen the efforts of the City Government of Ternate in addressing the food crisis, the indicators of collaborative governance processes chosen by the author remain the same. The author's mapping consists of joint dialogue, building trust, shared commitment, shared understanding, and interim results.

1. Dialogue between Actors

The joint dialogue between the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government regarding collaborative governance in the field of agriculture has only been conducted once. This official meeting was facilitated by the Bank Indonesia North Maluku Region. In this meeting, all parties agreed to establish cooperation in the field of agriculture. Ternate City is ready to accommodate the agricultural produce directly purchased by traders at the Bahari Berkesan market. Meanwhile, the group of farmers who are chosen as partners are also ready to sell their produce to Ternate. Subsequent meetings will be conducted informally between traders from Ternate and farmers from East Halmahera.

However, in this dialogue, it is necessary to build trust, mutual respect, shared understanding, and commitment to the process. The dialogue should also identify opportunities for mutual benefit, ensure that all parties involved in the collaboration process understand the goals and expected benefits, identify and discuss potential barriers in the collaboration process, identify and discuss strategies to overcome the encountered barriers, identify and discuss ways to measure the performance and outcomes of the collaboration process, identify and discuss ways to measure the impact of the collaboration process, and identify and discuss ways to ensure that all parties involved in the collaboration process receive fair benefits.

In the joint dialogue on collaborative governance, other stakeholders involved in the agricultural sector should also be invited. This is important to ensure that all parties involved in the collaboration process have a comprehensive understanding of the goals and expected benefits. These stakeholders can provide valuable input on the strategies to overcome encountered barriers, as well as ways to measure the performance and outcomes of the collaboration process.

To ensure that the collaborative governance conducted by the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government can be sustained, all parties need to maintain clear, open, constructive, and continuous communication. They must ensure that all information shared in the collaboration process is clear and easily understood, and create space for open and honest dialogue. They should also avoid communication that is attacking or blaming in nature, and instead opt for constructive communication.

2. Shared Trust

The Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government must create a safe and conducive environment to build trust, establish mechanisms to identify and resolve issues that may arise in the collaborative process, ensure that all stakeholders have equal access to relevant information and resources, ensure that all stakeholders have an equal opportunity to express their views and opinions, ensure that all stakeholders have an equal opportunity to influence the collaborative process, ensure that all stakeholders have an equal opportunity to benefit from the collaborative outcomes, and ensure that all stakeholders have an equal opportunity to participate in the collaborative process. These are key factors in building trust in collaborative governance. This is because the collaborative governance initiated by the parties has only been in place for approximately one year, making shared trust a necessity to support future collaborative governance processes.

3. Commitment to Collaborative Governance

To strengthen the commitment of the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government to collaboration, all parties must create an open and inclusive environment where stakeholders can freely share information and ideas. They should also build strong partnerships among stakeholders by creating mechanisms to promote effective communication and facilitate productive discussions. Additionally, it is important to provide training on the benefits of cooperation and how to achieve common goals, as well as establish mechanisms to monitor and evaluate the performance of stakeholders and take necessary actions. Lastly, it is crucial to ensure that stakeholders have opportunities to actively participate in the collaborative process. Efforts to strengthen commitment to support collaborative governance should be emphasized from the beginning of the implementation of this agricultural cooperation. Failure to do so may disrupt various agendas discussed by the parties.

4. Shared Understanding Among Parties

To build a shared understanding between the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government, the following steps should be taken: establish effective communication to understand the goals, mission, vision, and core values of the collaborative project; build trust through dialogue, discussions, and actions that demonstrate commitment from all parties; develop clear strategies to achieve common goals; establish mechanisms to measure the performance and outcomes of the collaborative project; and create mechanisms to adopt and implement necessary changes to achieve shared objectives. Shared understanding among the parties is important because this collaborative governance in the agricultural sector has only been in place for approximately one year. Therefore, the parties have not fully understood all the goals and agendas of this cooperation. The parties must ensure that all relevant local government agencies involved understand the objectives of collaborative governance in the agricultural sector.

5. Benefits Among Each Other

To ensure that all parties receive appropriate benefits from collaboration, they must establish clear goals and communicate the benefits to be obtained, set realistic objectives and complete small projects that can yield small victories, develop strategies to explore collaborative value, and develop mechanisms to ensure that the benefits obtained from collaboration are shared fairly. By doing these things, the parties will be able to build trust and achieve the desired collaboration goals. Since the collaborative governance carried out jointly by the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Government in the agricultural sector has only been going on for approximately one year, the impact of this collaboration has not yet been felt by the parties, especially the local farmers in East Halmahera and the fulfillment of horticultural food needs in the markets of Ternate City.

4.3 Prediction of Future Challenges

The efforts of the Ternate City Government in addressing the food crisis through a collaborative governance approach will undoubtedly face various challenges in the future. There are several challenges that need to be anticipated together with the East Halmahera Regency Government to ensure the sustainability of collaborative governance in the agricultural sector. The following are some challenges identified by the researchers:

1. Sustainable Production Increase

The challenge of increasing agricultural production sustainably can be addressed through various means, including improving soil quality, enhancing fertilizer usage, adopting advanced technologies, ensuring water availability, improving seed quality, enhancing land management practices, and improving forest management practices. By increasing agricultural production sustainably, it is expected to meet the demand for sustainable food supply. Therefore, all parties involved should prioritize this as a discussion agenda in future collaborative governance. On the other hand, the East Halmahera Regency government also faces the challenge of meeting the supply demand in the local market. If this collaboration is successful, it may have an impact on the stabilization of horticultural food stocks in East Halmahera.

2. Improvement of Agricultural Product Quality through Technology and Innovation

Improving the quality of agricultural products through technology and innovation is one way to enhance productivity and production efficiency in agriculture. Technology and innovation can assist farmers in improving the quality of agricultural products by enhancing the quality of raw materials, reducing production costs, increasing productivity, and improving the quality of the final products. Technology and innovation can aid farmers in enhancing the quality of agricultural products by utilizing modern technologies such as agricultural information systems, quality monitoring systems, pest control systems, and processing technologies. All parties involved in collaborative governance should prioritize this issue as a key agenda in their cooperation.

3. Improving Market Access for Farmers

Ternate City can play a crucial role in enhancing market access for local farmers to increase their income. One way to achieve this is by promoting local farmers' products in the local and regional markets. Ternate City can assist local farmers by facilitating training programs to enhance their skills in developing quality and appealing products. Ternate City can also facilitate market access for local farmers by establishing markets that focus on local farmers' products. Additionally, Ternate City can support local farmers by facilitating access to technologies that can help them improve productivity and efficiency. Furthermore, Ternate City can assist local farmers by facilitating access to funding to support their business development.

4. Increasing Awareness of the Importance of Agricultural Waste Management

This challenge needs to be anticipated as agricultural waste can cause serious environmental issues. Agricultural waste can contain hazardous chemicals and organic materials that can lead to water, soil, and air pollution. It can also result in biological contamination, such as the spread of pathogens and pests. Increasing awareness of the importance of environmentally friendly agricultural waste management can help reduce environmental problems caused by agricultural waste.

To enhance farmers' awareness, various actions can be taken by all parties involved. These include disseminating information about the importance of environmentally friendly agricultural waste management through various media channels, providing training on the significance of environmentally friendly agricultural waste management, offering technical assistance to help farmers manage agricultural waste in an environmentally friendly manner, and providing financial support to assist farmers in managing environmentally friendly agricultural waste.

5. Increasing Awareness of the Importance of Pest and Disease Management.

Sustainable management of pests and plant diseases is crucial for maintaining plant health and agricultural production. This management can help reduce the use of pesticides and other harmful chemicals to the environment and human health. It can also help reduce production costs and enhance crop productivity. To achieve this, all parties can provide farmers with information on sustainable pest and disease management through mass media, seminars, and training. Additionally, farmers should be provided with the necessary tools and materials for sustainable pest and disease management, as well as technical support to assist them in implementing sustainable pest and disease management practices. To encourage farmers to engage in sustainable pest and disease management, incentives should also be provided to them.

6. Increasing Awareness of the Importance of Seed Management.

Awareness of the importance of sustainable seed management is increasing because seeds are a vital natural resource for human life. Seeds provide food, clothing, and raw materials for industries. Seeds also provide raw materials for traditional medicine and modern pharmaceuticals. Therefore, society can use seeds efficiently and sustainably to meet their needs. This will also help maintain the availability of seeds for future generations. To achieve this, all parties can pay attention to farmers by teaching them how to select and use the right seeds, how to store seeds, plant seeds, and collect seeds for future use, as well as how to use environmentally friendly seeds and avoid using seeds containing pesticides. Education and campaigns should also be conducted to disseminate information about the importance of sustainable seed management in the community.

V. CONCLUSION

The Ternate City Government is collaborating with the East Halmahera Regency Government to address the potential food crisis. East Halmahera has advantages in the agricultural sector with increased food production and significant agricultural land area. On the other hand, Ternate experiences a lack of horticultural food production and has to import most of its needs from outside the region. Bank Indonesia in the North Maluku region supports this collaboration by involving farmer groups and food traders in Ternate City. This collaboration is expected to overcome the food crisis and ensure the smooth distribution of supplies.

The collaborative governance between the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government agrees that the Ternate City Government will accommodate the agricultural produce of East Halmahera farmers and sell them at the Bahari Berkesan market. The parties need to discuss strategies to overcome potential barriers in the collaboration process, as well as ways to measure the performance and impact of this collaboration. Especially strengthening joint dialogue, joint trust, joint commitment, joint understanding, and joint results.

The challenges faced are sustainable agricultural production, improving product quality through technology and innovation, market access for farmers, agricultural waste management, pest and disease management, and seed management. Actions that need to be taken include cooperation between the Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government, promotion of local farmer products, education and training, as well as technical and financial support. Points that need to be further discussed are strategies for increasing agricultural production, implementing technology and innovation, and steps to improve market access for farmers.

VI. RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government should establish collaborative governance in the field of agriculture, so that various cooperation agendas can be implemented and able to achieve the desired goals together.
2. The Ternate City Government continues to build effective communication with traders in the Bahari market so that they continuously buy horticultural agricultural products from farmers in East Halmahera.
3. The Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government should involve stakeholders in the region such as Bank Indonesia North Maluku Region to support the collaborative governance process in the field of agriculture.

4. The Ternate City Government and the East Halmahera Regency Government should strengthen the collaboration process related to aspects of joint dialogue, joint trust, joint commitment, joint understanding, and joint results.

REFERENCES

- [1]. Amsler, L. B. (2016). Collaborative governance: Integrating management, politics, and law. *Public Administration Review*, 76(5), 700-711. <https://doi.org/10.1111/puar.12605>
- [2]. Ansell, C., & Gash, A. (2008). Collaborative governance in theory and practice. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 18(4), 543-571. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mum032>
- [3]. Badan Pusat Statistik Kabupaten Halmahera Timur. (2023). Kabupaten Halmahera Timur Dalam Angka 2023. Diakses dari <https://haltimkab.bps.go.id/publication.html>
- [4]. Baharuddin, A., Rahmatia, R., Rusmin, J. H., & Islami, F. N. (2023). Plant What You Eat: Politik Keseharian Komunitas Urban Farming Makassar dalam Merespon Permasalahan Global Terkait Krisis Pangan. *Hasanuddin Journal of International Affairs*, 3(01), 35-43. <https://doi.org/10.31947/hjirs.v3i01>
- [5]. Bianchi, C., Nasi, G., & Rivenbark, W. C. (2021). Implementing collaborative governance: models, experiences, and challenges. *Public Management Review*, 23(11), 1581-1589. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2021.1878777>
- [6]. Bingham, L. B. (2011). Collaborative governance. *The SAGE handbook of governance*, 386-401.
- [7]. Emerson, K., Nabatchi, T., & Balogh, S. (2012). An integrative framework for collaborative governance. *Journal of public administration research and theory*, 22(1), 1-29. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jopart/mur011>
- [8]. Fatimah, P., Mahsyar, A., & Kasmad, R. (2021). Collaborative Governance Dalam Pemberdayaan Kelompok Tani Di Kabupaten Wajo. *Kajian Ilmiah Mahasiswa Administrasi Publik (KIMAP)*, 2(1), 294-307.
- [9]. Gash, A. (2022). Collaborative governance. In *Handbook on theories of governance*. (Edward Elgar Publishing).
- [10]. Haris, A. (2022). Collaborative Governance Dinas Pertanian Manggarai Timur dalam Upaya Meningkatkan Kinerja Sektor Pertanian. *Indonesian Journal of Intellectual Publication*, 3(1), 41-47. <https://doi.org/10.51577/ijpublication.v3i1.370>
- [11]. Hikmawan, M. D., Hamid, A., Nurrohman, B., Ramadhan, G., & Maâ, Y. (2020). Collaborative Governance Model on Agricultural Business in Banten, Indonesia. *Jurnal Transformatif*, 6(2), 176-201.
- [12]. Lasminingrat, L., & Efriza, E. (2020). Pembangunan Lumbung Pangan Nasional: Strategi Antisipasi Krisis Pangan Indonesia. *Jurnal Pertahanan dan Bela Negara*, 10(3), 243-260. DOI: 10.33172/jpbh.v10i3.1053
- [13]. Liu, Y., Wu, J., Yi, H., & Wen, J. (2021). Under what conditions do governments collaborate? A qualitative comparative analysis of air pollution control in China. *Public Management Review*, 23(11), 1664-1682. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2021.1879915>
- [14]. Muthmainnah, S. (2022, Agustus 24). Inflasi pangan diatas target, tpid lakukan sosialisasi dan operasi pasar. <https://kalesang.id/2022/08/24/inflasi-pangan-nasional-capai-11-persen-dari-angka-normal-2-4-persen-malut-capai-527-persen/>
- [15]. Newman, J., Barnes, M., Sullivan, H., & Knops, A. (2004). Public participation and collaborative governance. *Journal of social policy*, 33(2), 203-223.
- [16]. Scott, R. J., & Merton, E. R. (2021). When the going gets tough, the goal-committed get going: overcoming the transaction costs of inter-agency collaborative governance. *Public Management Review*, 23(11), 1640-1663. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14719037.2021.1879916>
- [17]. Udi. (2023, Februari 16). TPID Kota Ternate Gelar Rakor Antisipasi Lonjakan Kebutuhan Pokok Jelang Ramadan. <https://www.nuansamalut.com/2023/02/16/tpid-kota-ternate-gelar-rakor-antisipasi-lonjakan-kebutuhan-pokok-jelang-ramadan/>